

FINAL ACTIONS
Planning Commission Meeting of October 23, 2012

| <u>AGENDA ITEM/ACTION</u> | <u>FOLLOW-UP ACTION</u> |
|---|---|
| <p>1. Call to Order.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meeting was called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Mr. Morris, Chair. PC members present were Mr. Morris, Mr. Loach, Mr. Dotson, Mr. Franco, Mr. Randolph and Mr. Smith. Absent were Mr. Lafferty, Vice-Chair and Ms. Monteith. • Staff present was Scott Clark, Sarah Baldwin, Brent Nelson, Amelia McCulley, Susan Stimart, Lee Catlin, J.T. Newberry, Francis MacCall, Bill Fritz, Mark Graham Wayne Cilimberg, David Benish, Sharon Taylor, and Greg Kemptner. | |
| <p>2. From the Public: Matters Not Listed for Public Hearing on the Agenda.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Due to time constraints to attend a funeral family night Wendy Shaver, with Albemarle Towing, spoke regarding ZTA-2010-00004 Industrial Uses and the need for locations to accommodate towing uses. | <p><u>Clerk:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No action required |
| <p>3. <u>Consent Agenda</u> <u>Approval of Minutes</u> July 17, 2012.</p> <p>APPROVED CONSENT AGENDA, by a vote of 6:0.</p> | <p><u>Clerk:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Finalize minutes for signature |
| <p>4. <u>Items Requesting Deferral:</u></p> <p><u>SP-2010-00049 Howardsville Camping</u> PROPOSED: Campground with 24 sites for recreational vehicles, 24 tent sites, building for office and restrooms. ZONING CATEGORY/GENERAL USAGE: RA Rural Areas - agricultural, forestal, and fishery uses; residential density (0.5 unit/acre in development lots); FH Flood Hazard - Overlay to provide safety and protection from flooding SECTION: 10.2.2.20 Day camp, boarding camp (reference 5.1.05) COMPREHENSIVE PLAN LAND USE/DENSITY: Rural Areas - preserve and protect agricultural, forestal, open space, and natural, historic and scenic resources/ density (.5 unit/ acre in development lots) ENTRANCE CORRIDOR: No LOCATION: Baber Lane, Howardsville, at the</p> | <p><u>Clerk:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Action Letters – Deferred SP-2010-00049 and SP-2010-00050 to November 13, 2012 as requested by applicant. • Schedule for PC Meeting on November 13, 2012. |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>intersection of James River Road (Route 626) and Howardsville Turnpike (Route 602) TAX MAP/PARCEL: 139A0000001600, 139A0000001700, 139A0000001900, 139A0000002000, 139A0000002100 MAGISTERIAL DISTRICT: Scottsville (Scott Clark)</p> <p style="text-align: center;">AND</p> <p>SP-2010-00050 Howardsville Canoe Livery</p> <p>PROPOSED: Howardsville Canoe Livery: Canoe-rental livery with use of campground building for office and storage (see SP201000049) ZONING CATEGORY/GENERAL USAGE: RA Rural Areas - agricultural, forestal, and fishery uses; residential density (0.5 unit/acre in development lots); FH Flood Hazard - Overlay to provide safety and protection from flooding SECTION: 30.3.05.2.1 (2): Water related uses such as boat docks, canoe liveries, bridges, ferries, culverts and river crossings of transmission lines of all types. COMPREHENSIVE PLAN LAND USE/DENSITY: Rural Areas - preserve and protect agricultural, forestal, open space, and natural, historic and scenic resources/ density (.5 unit/ acre in development lots) ENTRANCE CORRIDOR: No LOCATION: Baber Lane, Howardsville, at the intersection of James River Road (Route 626) and Howardsville Turnpike (Route 602) TAX MAP/PARCEL: 139A0000001600, 139A0000001700, 139A0000001900, 139A0000002000, 139A0000002100 MAGISTERIAL DISTRICT: Scottsville (Scott Clark)</p> <p>APPLICANT REQUESTING DEFERRAL OF THESE SPs TO THE NOVEMBER 13, 2012 PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING</p> <p>DEFERRED, by a vote of 6:0, SP-2010-000049 and SP-2010-00050 to November 13, 2012 as per the applicant's request.</p> | |
| <p>6. Public Hearing Items:</p> <p>AFD-2012-00006 Carter's Bridge Additions Notice is hereby given that the Albemarle County Planning Commission will hold a public hearing to receive public comments regarding the addition of the following parcel(s) to the Carter's Bridge Agricultural and Forestal District (Albemarle County Code § 3-222) on October 23, 2012, at 6 p.m., in the Auditorium of the Albemarle County Office Building, 401 McIntire Road,</p> | <p><u>Clerk:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Action Letter – Recommend approval of the Carter's Bridge Additions to Carter's Bridge Agricultural and Forestal District. • The request will go before Board of Supervisors on December 5, 2012. |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>Charlottesville, Virginia: Tax Map 112 Parcels 16J and 16K. The parcel(s) proposed for addition are approximately 268.85 acres in size and are located on Fry's Path (Route 627) approximately one mile north of Plank Road (Route 712). The Albemarle County Agricultural and Forestal Advisory Committee have recommended approval of this addition. (Scott Clark)</p> <p>RECOMMEND APPROVAL, of AFD-2012-00006 Carter's Bridge Additions to add two parcels (Tax Map 112, parcels 16J and 16K).</p> | |
| <p>7. <u>AFD-2012-00007 Blue Run Review</u> Periodic (10-year) review of the Blue Run Agricultural and Forestal District, as required in Section 15.2-4311 of the Code of Virginia. The district includes the properties described as Tax map 22, parcel 10; tax map 35, parcels 22, 23, 24A, 26, 26B, 26B1, 26C, 26D, 28A, 29, 31, 32A, 41A, 41E, 43; tax map 36, parcels 6A, 9, 20; tax map 49, parcels 4A1, 4A5, 24, 24A, 24B; tax map 50, parcels 5, 5B, 32A, 41A, 41Q, 42A, 42A1, 43, 45B, 47, 47A, 47B; tax map 51, parcels 13, 14. The district includes a total of 4,219 acres. The area is designated as Rural Area in the Comprehensive Plan and the included properties are zoned RA Rural Areas. (Scott Clark)</p> <p>RECOMMEND APPROVAL, by a vote of 6:0, for the continuance of AFD-2012-00007 Blue Run AFD for the next 10 years.</p> | <p><u>Clerk:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Action Letter – Recommend approval for the continuance of the Blue Run Agricultural/Forestal District for the next 10 years. • The request will go before Board of Supervisors on December 5, 2012. |
| <p>8. <u>SP-2012-00024 Verizon Wireless Va. Dept. of Forestry "Buckingham Circle" Tier III Personal Wireless Service Facility</u> PROPOSED: Request for installation of a 110 foot tall "steath" monopole structure ("monopine") and associated ground equipment. ZONING CATEGORY/GENERAL USAGE: CO Commercial Office – offices, supporting commercial and service; residential by special use permit (15 units/ acre); EC Entrance Corridor – Overlay to protect properties of historic, architectural or cultural significance from visual impacts of development along routes of tourist access SECTION: 23.2.2.15 Tier III personal wireless facilities COMPREHENSIVE PLAN LAND USE/DENSITY: Neighborhood 6; Office Service – office uses, regional scale research, limited production and</p> | <p><u>Clerk:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Action Letter – Recommend approval of SP-2012-00024 Verizon Wireless VA. Dept. of Forestry "Buckingham Circle" Tier III PWSF with the conditions as outlined in the staff report as shown in Attachment 1. • Recommend approval of the modifications for this personal wireless service facility under the special exception criteria of Section 31.8 of the Zoning Ordinance to include the color and diameter of the pole. <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Section 5.1.40c)(3) – no antenna to project more than 12 inches from a structure 2. Section 5.1.40(d)(5)-maximum base of the diameter 3. Section 5.1.40(d)(6)-height of the structure in relation to the reference tree. • The requests (SP-2012-24 and modifications) will |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>marketing activities, supporting commercial, lodging and conference facilities, and residential (6.01-34 units/acre). ENTRANCE CORRIDOR: YES LOCATION: 76 feet SW of Natural Resources Dr. on the Forestry Dept. Headquarters TAX MAP/PARCEL: 07600-00-00-017A0 MAGISTERIAL DISTRICT: Samuel Miller (Sarah Baldwin)</p> <p>RECOMMEND APPROVAL, by a vote of 4:2, (Dotson & Loach voted nay) of SP-2012-00024 Virginia Department of Forestry “Buckingham” Verizon Wireless Tier III PWSF with the conditions outlined in the staff report and shown in Attachment 1.</p> <p>RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF MODIFICATIONS, by a vote of 4:2 (Dotson & Loach nay), to Sections 5.1.40(c)(3), (d)(5) and (d)(6) under the special exception criteria of Section 31.8 of the Zoning Ordinance for SP-2012-00024 Virginia Department of Forestry “Buckingham” Verizon Wireless Tier III PWSF as shown in Attachment 1 for the reasons outlined in the staff report.</p> | <p>go before the Board of Supervisors on November 14, 2012.</p> |
| <p>9. <u>SP-2012-00025 Verizon Wireless – Piedmont College – Tier III PWSF</u> PROPOSAL: Tier III Personal wireless service facility on 157.49 acres. No dwellings proposed ZONING CATEGORY/GENERAL USAGE: RA Rural Areas - agricultural, forestal, and fishery uses; residential density (0.5 unit/acre in development lots) SECTION: Chapter 18 Section 10.2.2.48 of the Albemarle County Code, which allows for Tier III personal wireless service facilities (reference 5.1.40) ENTRANCE CORRIDOR OVERLAY DISTRICT: To protect properties of historic, architectural, or cultural significance from visual impacts of development along routes of tourist access: Yes COMPREHENSIVE PLAN: Institutional , Neighborhood 4, Institutional uses allow for a range of public uses including schools, universities and public recreational facilities. LOCATION: 1800 Monticello Avenue (Route 20) TAX MAP/PARCEL: 07700-00-00-02500 MAGISTERIAL DISTRICT: Scottsville (Brent Nelson)</p> <p>RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF SP-2012-00025, by a vote of 6:0, for Tier III PWSF with the conditions outlined in the staff report (Attachment 2), based on the findings</p> | <p>Clerk:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Action Letter – Recommend approval of SP-2012-00025 Verizon Wireless – Piedmont College – Tier III PWSF with the conditions as outlined in the staff report as shown in Attachment 2 based upon the reasons in the staff report. • Recommend approval of modifications under Section 5.1.40(d) of the Zoning Ordinance for a special exception to allow the facility at fourteen (14) feet above the tallest tree with the conditions outlined, as listed below: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Section 5.1.40(d)(6)-height of the structure in relation to the reference tree. • The requests (SP-2012-24 and modifications) will go before the Board of Supervisors on November 14, 2012. |

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>presented in the staff report.</p> <p>RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF MODIFICATIONS, by a vote of 6:0, under Section 5.1.40(d) of the Zoning Ordinance to allow a special exception for a Tier III personal wireless service facility at fourteen (14) feet above the reference tree as noted in Attachment 2 for the reasons outlined in the staff report.</p> | |
| <p>The Planning Commission recessed at 6:57 p.m. The meeting reconvened at 7:02 p.m.</p> | |
| <p>10. ZTA-2010-00004 Industrial Uses – Amend Secs. 3.1, Definitions, 4.14.5, Certified engineer’s report, 5.1.10, Junk yards, 5.1.15, Sawmill, temporary or permanent, 5.1.20, Sale and/or storage of petroleum products including kerosene, gasoline, and heating oil, 5.1.21, Dwellings in commercial and industrial districts, 5.1.31, Body shop, 8.5.5.2, Review of site plans and subdivision plats, 26.1, Intent, where permitted, 26.3, Permitted and accessory uses and structures, 26.6, Height regulations, 26.10, Minimum yards requirements, 27.1, Intent, where permitted, 27.2, Permitted uses, 27.4, Additional requirement, 28.1, Intent, where permitted, 28.2, Permitted uses, 28.4, Additional requirements, 29.1, Intent, where permitted, 29.2, Permitted uses, 29.5, Additional requirements; by adding Secs. 5.1.49, Dry cleaning plants, 5.1.50, Foundries, 5.1.51, Outdoor activities, 5.1.52, Outdoor storage, 5.1.53, Rendering facilities, 5.1.54, Slaughterhouses, 5.1.55, Tire recycling yards, 26.6, Site development and use; and by repealing Secs. 26.2, Application, 26.4, Standard ratios, 26.5, Off-street parking and loading requirements, 26.7, Performance standards, 26.8, Sign regulations, 26.9, Minimum landscaped area, 26.11, Utility requirements, 26.12, Site planning – external relationships, 26.12.1, Vehicular access, 26.13, Building separation, 27.2.1, By right, 27.2.2, By special use permit, 27.3, Minimum area required for establishment of district, 28.2.1, By right, 28.2.2, By special use permit, 28.3, Minimum area required for establishment of district, 29.2.1, By right – Category I, 29.2.2, By special use permit – Category I , 29.2.3, By right – Category II, 29.2.4, By special use permit – Category II, 29.3, Minimum area required for creation of district, 29.4, Number of permitted uses; of</p> | <p><u>Clerk:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Action Letter – Recommended approval of ZTA-2010-00004 as provided in Attachment D of staff report inclusive of modifications to refer to rural areas district rather than agricultural district in 26.4 Minimum yards and refer to GFA of <i>use</i> rather than of <i>building</i> for independent offices in the office use table. • Action Letter – Approved the Resolution of Intent regarding by-right industrial uses in commercial districts as provided in Attachment F of the staff report. • ZTA-2010-00004 will go before the Board of Supervisors on a date to be determined. • A ZTA under the resolution of intent will come before the Planning Commission on a date to be determined. |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>Chapter 18, Zoning, of the Albemarle County Code. This ordinance would amend the regulations pertaining to industrial uses by adding definitions pertaining to certain industrial and common use classifications (3.1); amend the requirements for the certified engineer's report (4.14.5); amend and add supplemental regulations applicable to several uses that are industrial in character (5.1.10, 5.1.15, 5.1.20, 5.1.21, 5.1.31; 5.1.49, 5.1.50, 5.1.51, 5.1.52, 5.1.53, 5.1.54, 5.1.55); amend the regulations for the review of site plans and subdivision plats within the PD-IP zoning district (8.5.5.2); and amend the industrial zoning district regulations by revising each district's stated intent, the uses allowed by right and by special use permit, the area of certain uses allowed by right and by special exception, the accessory uses allowed and prohibited, and other uses prohibited, by renumbering and reorganizing those district regulations, and by repealing certain regulations (26.1 through 29.4).</p> <p>RECOMMENDED ADOPTION OF ZTA-2010-00004, by a vote of 6:0, as provided in Attachment D of staff report inclusive of modifications to refer to rural areas district rather than agricultural district in 26.4 Minimum yards and refer to GFA of <i>use</i> rather than of <i>building</i> for independent offices in the office use table</p> <p>APPROVED ADOPTION of the Resolution of Intent regarding by-right industrial uses in commercial districts as provided in Attachment F.</p> | |
| <p>11. Deferred Item</p> <p><u>ZTA-2012-00006 Legislative Review Process Improvements</u> – Amend Secs. 1.7, Official zoning map, 3.1, Definitions, 4.8.1, Determinations concerning unspecified uses, 4.15.5, Signs authorized by special use permit, 10.5.2, Where permitted by special use permit, 20.1, Intent, where permitted, 20.2, Application, 30.1.2, Application, 30.5.5, Permitted uses by right and special permit, 31.1, Designation of zoning administrator, authority, 34.4, Application for variances, 35.1, Fees; and repeal Secs. 1.9, Application for land use permit; payment of delinquent taxes, 8.5.1, Applications and documents to be submitted, 8.5.2,</p> | <p><u>Clerk:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Action Letter – Recommend approval of ZTA-2012-00006 as with an effective date of April 1, 2013 inclusive of the suggested changes made by the Commissioners with respect to the purposes of the pre-application meetings, community meetings, work sessions and the other items discussed by the Commissioners as shown in Attachment 3. • The request will go before the Board of Supervisors on a date to be determined. |

Preapplication conferences, 8.5.3, Review and recommendation by the planning commission, 8.5.4, Review and action by the board of supervisors; effect of approval, 8.6, Amendments to planned development districts, 20A.3, Application requirements; required documents and information, 20A.4, Application plans, 31.6, Special use permits, 31.6.1, Reserved to board of supervisors, 31.6.2, Application, 31.6.3, Conditions, 31.6.4, Revocation, 31.8, Special exceptions, and 33 (and its subsections), Amendments; and adding Secs. 33.1, Purpose and intent, 33.2, Uniform requirements for the initiation of zoning text amendments and zoning map amendments, 33.3, Uniform procedures for zoning text amendments and county-initiated zoning map amendments, 33.4, Uniform procedures for owner-initiated zoning map amendments and special use permits, 33.5, Uniform procedures for special exceptions, 33.6, Zoning text amendments and zoning map amendments; relevant factors to be considered; effect of approval, 33.7, Owner-initiated zoning map amendments; authority to accept proffers, 33.8, Special use permits; relevant factors to be considered; conditions; revocation, 33.9, Special exceptions; relevant factors to be considered; conditions; of Chapter 18, Zoning, of the Albemarle County Code. This ordinance would amend the regulations pertaining to the zoning map and its interpretation (1.7); relocate the obligation to pay delinquent taxes as a condition of applying for a land use permit but add and update that obligation (from 1.9 to 33.4 and 34.4); add definitions (3.1); update cross-references to related sections (4.8.1, 4.15.5, 10.5.2, 20.1, 20.2, 30.1.2, 30.5.5); relocate the application requirements, procedures and relevant considerations for planned developments (from 8.5.1 through 8.5.4 and 8.5.6), the neighborhood model district (from 20A.3 and 20A.4), special use permits (from 31.6.1 through 31.6.4) and special exceptions (from 31.8), to section 33 and its subsections; add express authority for the zoning administrator to administer and enforce proffers and to keep and make available a conditional zoning index (31.1), and allow application fees for zoning map amendments and special use permits to be paid when the application is determined to be complete instead of at the time the

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>application is first submitted (35.1). In repealing the existing regulations for zoning map and zoning text amendments in Sec. 33(current 33.0 through 33.10), this ordinance would consolidate all legislative zoning actions of the board of supervisors in new subsections in Sec. 33 applicable to zoning map amendments, zoning text amendments, special use permits and special exceptions and these subsections would pertain to purpose and intent (33.1), uniform requirements for the initiation of zoning text amendments and zoning map amendments (33.2), uniform procedures for zoning text amendments and county-initiated zoning map amendments (33.3), uniform procedures for owner-initiated zoning map amendments and special use permits (33.4), uniform procedures for special exceptions (33.5), relevant factors to be considered for zoning text amendments and zoning map amendments and the effect of approval (33.6), authority to accept proffers in conjunction with owner-initiated zoning map amendments (33.7), relevant factors to be considered for special use permits and authority to impose conditions and revoke permit (33.8), and relevant factors to be considered for special exceptions and authority to impose conditions (33.9). (Wayne Cilimberg)</p> <p>DEFERRED FROM THE AUGUST 21, 2012 PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING</p> <p>RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF ZTA-2012-000006, by a vote of 6:0, with an effective date of April 1, 2013, inclusive of the suggested changes made by the Commissioners with respect to the purposes of the pre-application meetings, community meetings, work sessions and the other items discussed by the Commissioners as shown in Attachment 3.</p> | |
| <p>12. Old Business</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next week there is a proposed work session on the Comp Plan. An email came through today from the City that has three attachments talked about in the last City/County PC joint session regarding subcommittees that the Commissioners should be aware of. | <p><u>Staff:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • None |
| <p>13. New Business</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NEXT MEETING ON OCTOBER 30, 2012 | <p><u>Staff:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • None |
| <p>14. Adjourn to October 30, 2012, 6:00 p.m.,</p> | |

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>Auditorium, Second Floor, County Office Building, 401 McIntire Road, Charlottesville, Virginia.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The meeting was adjourned at 8:28 p.m. | |
|---|--|

Attachment 1 – SP-2012-00024 Verizon Wireless Va. Dept. of Forestry "Buckingham Circle" Tier III Personal Wireless Service Facility - Recommended Conditions of Approval -

Attachment 2 – SP-2012-00025 Verizon Wireless – Piedmont College – Tier III PWSF - Recommended Conditions of Approval

Attachment 3 – ZTA-2012-00006 Legislative Review Process Improvements - Recommended Conditions of Approval -

**Attachment 1 –
SP-2012-00024 Virginia Department of Forestry “Buckingham” Verizon Wireless Tier III PWSF &
Modifications
Recommended Conditions of Approval**

The Planning Commission, by a vote of 4:2, (Loach & Dotson nay) recommends approval of SP-2012-00024 Virginia Department of Forestry “Buckingham” Verizon Wireless Tier III PWSF subject to the conditions outlined in the staff report, as follows,

1. Development and use shall be in general accord with what is described in the applicant's request and site plans, entitled “Buckingham Circle Rawland Monopine,” with a final zoning drawing submittal date of 9/25/12 (hereafter “Conceptual Plan”), as determined by the Director of Planning and Zoning Administrator. To be in accord with the Conceptual Plan, development and use shall reflect the following major elements within the development essential to the design of the development, as shown on the Conceptual Plan:
 - a. Height
 - b. Mounting height
 - c. Antenna type
 - d. Number of antenna
 - e. Color
 - f. Location of ground equipment

Minor modifications to the plan which do not conflict with the elements above may be made to ensure compliance with the Zoning Ordinance.

The Planning Commission, by a vote of 4:2 (Loach & Dotson nay), recommend approval of the modifications for special exceptions of this personal wireless service facility as proposed with an addition to include the two recommendations as staff works them out to address the color and diameter of the pole.

1. Section 5.1.40c)(3) – no antenna to project more than 12 inches from a structure
2. Section 5.1.40(d)(5)-maximum base of the diameter
3. Section 5.1.40(d)(6)-height of the structure in relation to the reference tree.

**Attachment 2 –
SP-2012-00025 Verizon Wireless – Piedmont College – Tier III PWSF
Recommended Conditions of Approval**

The Planning Commission, by a vote of 6:0, recommends approval of SP-2012-00025 Verizon Wireless – Piedmont College – Tier III PWSF subject to the conditions outlined in the staff report, as follows,

Development and use shall be in general accord with the conceptual plan titled “Piedmont College Rawland Monopole (University of VA Real Estate Foundation Property) prepared by Justin Yoon latest revision date 9/25/12 (hereafter “Conceptual Plan”), as determined by the Director of Planning and the Zoning Administrator. To be in general accord with the Conceptual Plan, development and use shall reflect the following major elements within the development essential to the design of the development, as shown on the Conceptual Plan.:

- Height
- Mounting type
- Antenna type
- Number of antenna
- Distance above reference tree
- Color
- Location of ground equipment and monopole

Minor modifications to the plan which do not conflict with the elements above may be made to ensure compliance with the Zoning Ordinance.

The Planning Commission, by a vote of 6:0, recommends approval of the modifications for special exceptions of this personal wireless service facility to allow the facility at fourteen (14) feet above the tallest tree with the conditions outlined, as listed below:

- Section 5.1.40(d)(6)-height of the structure in relation to the reference tree.

**Attachment 3 -
Recommendations – ZTA-2012-00006 Legislative Review Process Improvements**

The Planning Commission recommended approval of ZTA-2012-00006 with an effective date of April 1, 2013 that allows for further development of administrative process to enact the ordinance and provide for exceptions. Action is inclusive of suggested changes made by the Commissioners with respect to the purposes of the pre-application meetings, community meetings, work sessions and the other items discussed by the Commissioners as outlined in the minutes.