

An adjourned meeting of the Board of Supervisors of Albemarle County, Virginia, was held on February 23, 2015, at 6:00 p.m., Lane Auditorium, County Office Building, McIntire Road, Charlottesville, Virginia. The meeting was adjourned from February 19, 2015.

PRESENT: Mr. Kenneth C. Boyd, Ms. Jane D. Dittmar, Ms. Ann Mallek, Ms. Diantha H. McKeel, Ms. Liz A. Palmer and Mr. Brad L. Sheffield.

ABSENT: None.

OFFICERS PRESENT: County Executive, Thomas C. Foley, County Attorney, Larry W. Davis, Clerk, Ella W. Jordan, and Senior Deputy Clerk, Travis O. Morris.

Agenda Item No. 1. The meeting was called to order at 6:03 p.m. by the Chair, Ms. Dittmar.

Agenda Item No. 2. Pledge of Allegiance.
Agenda Item No. 3. Moment of Silence.

Agenda Item. No. 4. Adoption of Final Agenda.

Motion was entered by Mr. Sheffield to adopt the final agenda. Ms. Palmer **seconded** the motion. Roll was called and the motion carried by the following recorded vote:

AYES: Ms. Dittmar, Ms. Mallek, Ms. McKeel, Ms. Palmer, Mr. Sheffield and Mr. Boyd.
NAYS: None.

Agenda Item. No. 5. Brief Announcements by Board Members.

Ms. Mallek commented that she was ready for spring.

Mr. Sheffield announced that the Board of Supervisors does not control school closings.

Agenda Item. No. 6. From the Public: Matters Not Listed for Public Hearing on the Agenda.

Ms. Nancy Carpenter from the Scottsville District stated that she made a comment a few weeks earlier regarding a new initiative at the end of March called "Spring for Housing" whereby there will be individuals coming out of PACEM housing and, hopefully, there will be some in the community who would help make the transition from homelessness to being a tenant a pleasant experience. Ms. Carpenter noted that, for many individuals, it has been quite a while since they had a home of their own, and they would welcome some help when it came to small necessities to make it a pleasant and smooth transition. She stated that she was hoping for a very positive outcome from this initiative, and this is what Albemarle County and the City of Charlottesville should advocate for and support as a regional issue to help support homelessness.

Mr. Chuck Hawkins addressed the Board, stating that spring is a good time to be optimistic. He said he and his wife moved to Pantops Mountain from out in the country. Mr. Hawkins said they live in the section that is north of the highway, which is nicely dense in population with beautiful architecture and wonderful ways of traveling around on foot with nice sidewalks and walking trails. He stated that there are a lot of people his and his wife's age who walk also, as do mothers pushing strollers and other young people. He said he is hoping for some kind of crossing over the highway of Route 250 so people can get to the shopping centers and patronize those businesses. Mr. Hawkins said it is currently impossible to cross Route 250; cars are desperate out there, jockeying for lanes, moving fast and coming around corners with not even a painted line to tell a person where to cross. He stated that a person cannot really cross there and noted that several people have been killed attempting to do so.

Mr. Boyd asked Mr. Hawkins if he had brought a petition and if that had been submitted to the Clerk. Mr. Hawkins confirmed that he had.

Agenda Item. No. 7. **PUBLIC HEARING** to receive comments on the County Executive's FY 2015/2016 Recommended Budget. (*Advertised in the Daily Progress on February 16 and February 22, 2015*)

Mr. Tom Foley addressed the Board, stating that he would provide an overview of the proposed budget so citizens would have the benefit of hearing the same presentation the Board heard last week. He said the details and the presentation are both available online if people would like to study it further. Mr. Foley said, prior to getting into the proposed budget for FY16, he would provide a brief background on the challenges the County faced in developing the budget for the Board's consideration. He stated that, last fall, the Board spent a lot of time talking about the five-year financial picture rather than just the annual picture. He said the purpose of those discussions was to talk about the challenges to be faced in the future in terms of expected revenues and expenditures which staff felt were necessary as the County moves into the future. Mr. Foley explained that the line at the top and the line at the bottom represent a

gap between the revenues expected and the expenditures projected for new police officers, social service workers and contributions to schools, as well as some other items which have been important to the County in the past, both in terms of very basic core services and those items that were more aspirational as part of the Comprehensive Plan and some of the other budgets in the past. Mr. Foley stated that this gap presented a big challenge, and a lot of time was spent talking about that in the fall in an effort to engage the public related to those challenges.

Mr. Foley said some of the most compelling items discussed last fall in terms of being behind were represented in the slides he would present. Mr. Foley said the first slide indicated that the County's Police Department currently ranks 126 out of 133 jurisdictions in Virginia that have police forces, in terms of staffing per capita. He stated that this puts the County far behind comparable localities and, when compared to the City of Charlottesville, it shows the City currently provides five times more police coverage in its urban areas than the County. Mr. Foley said, in the Department of Social Services, based on state studies, the County is 23.3 positions understaffed and working currently at 163 capacity of the staff the Social Services Department had in place against the caseload it had to handle. He stated that this has led to a 94% increase in overtime since 2009, and the turnover rate since 2008 has increased from 8% to 13.5%. Mr. Foley said, in the school system, from 2009 through the five-year period projected and studied in the fall, the School Division is expected to see 2,000 new students, along with the challenges those students would bring. He stated that the demographics of those students have changed pretty dramatically over the last five years, adding that the number of students on free and reduced lunch has increased by just over 1,000 – or 44% – from FY10 to FY15; students requiring English as a Second Language (ESL) assistance has increased by 103 students – or 17% – in that same five-year period.

Mr. Foley said the Board heard some very compelling stories from staff regarding the current capacity of the organization and the challenges the County is facing in providing quality services and, in looking at the five-year plan, staff came to some conclusions. He stated that projected revenue growth fails to keep pace with unmet needs and strategic aspirations; the County is essentially working in a redefined relationship with state government that used to provide some of the costs of providing some of these services and has continued to cut back year after year while requiring more responsibility from local government. Mr. Foley noted that the County needs to rebuild its critical capacity lost during the recession, such as the police officer ratio to population growth, which is falling further behind. He stated that the County was challenged to keep up with population growth and changing demographics with the school system, as well as other services with general population increases that was felt during the recession years and also looking forward. Mr. Foley said all of this has created challenges and also the gap he mentioned earlier. He said, going forward, the County will have to think about things differently and take some new approaches to solve the challenge. He stated that this would mean reconsidering existing assumptions about percentages and formulas used to fund schools and capital programs, and current practices would need to be reevaluated, even though some of that was done during the recession. Mr. Foley said the County would also have to seek greater levels of input from the public, and these things are reflected in his budget proposal.

Mr. Foley stated that, in looking to the future, it will be important to take a step back and look at what the County did during the recession, because a lot of effort has been put into trying to come through intact. He said, as the chart before Supervisors indicates, of the 75 positions eliminated during the recession years, the County has only added positions back in health, welfare, public safety and judicial. He noted that all other functional areas remain below the levels which existed when the recession started. Mr. Foley said, during this period of time, the County invested in the establishment of an Economic Development Office, which was just beginning, to help get some additional investment in jobs that will help generate revenues for services. He stated that the County has looked at alternative sources of revenue, partnerships with the schools and the region, established an Innovation Fund to try to come up with more efficiencies, and accelerated the pace of getting grants with more than \$3 million of grants acquired in FY14. Mr. Foley said staffing levels remain at the 2006 level in comparing the recession years to today. He stated that, during this period, the County has not reduced its efforts to be a well-managed locality, and has been recognized as one of 39 counties in the country that have received a triple AAA-bond rating, which is an indication of its strong financial management. Mr. Foley said the County's tax rate remains among the lowest of Virginia's 20 most populated counties, and the tax bill for the average homeowner has declined for four years and is still at the 2009 level. He stated that the County has also been recognized for its budgeting and financial management reporting, as well as for some technological advancements.

Mr. Foley said, as the Board looks to the future and the budget before it, staff has established some very specific goals to help guide decision making as the Board proceeds. He said the first three goals were used throughout the recession and continue: meet evolving mandates and obligations which the County has no choice but to meet; sustain an efficient and adaptable organization; and build critical capacity that supports quality service delivery. Mr. Foley said those have been hallmarks of the County's efforts throughout the recession but, in order to address the challenges the County is now facing, the next three goals have become a priority in this budget: (1) redirect current funding from enhanced programs to core services. He noted that, given the funding gap, redirection of capital program funds such as Acquisition of Conservation Easements (ACE), construction of sidewalks, and modernization of schools, were all eliminated from the five-year review; (2) dedicate any proposed tax increase to specific core services, with this budget reflecting a one-cent tax increase that would go exclusively to the County's Fire/Rescue Department to pay for increasing costs of service as demanded by citizens; and (3) create a structured community dialogue on funding the future, acknowledging that the challenges would not be solved in just one year. He emphasized that the things developed in this proposed budget are not going to carry the County through the five years. Mr. Foley explained that staff is also proposing the

establishment of a community citizens advisory group which would help look at these challenges going forward.

Mr. Foley stated that he would review the highlights of the total budget. He said the recommended budget or total revenues were \$370.6 million. He said that amount is comprised of 43% from general property taxes – including real estate and personal property as the largest shares; other local revenues comprised 22% of the revenues received – such as sales and meals tax collections; the state provides about 21% of the support; federal revenues are at about 4%; and borrowing proceeds for the capital program are at 7%. Mr. Foley said staff is proposing using some one-time money from the fund balance to help meet the one-time obligations the County has. He said, on the expenditure side, what is typical each year is about 54% going to the school system to support its operations, capital and debt service; and, on the general government side, the total is about 42% for operations, capital and debt. Mr. Foley said the County also provides approximately 4% of its funding to the City of Charlottesville under the mandated revenue-sharing obligation with the City. He said some of the highlights of this budget are: it is a 5.3% increase for 2015; 3.5% of that increase is for operational costs for schools, local government, and everything done on a day to day basis. He said there is a 17.2% increase in the capital budget for critical investments, particularly in public safety and maintenance. Mr. Foley stated that the budget was built on an 80.9% tax increase. He said general fund revenues are up 3.2% over the previous year, which reflects the one cent dedicated to Fire/Rescue as well as the increase in property values, which were up about 2.3% for existing property values with additional increased value due to new construction. Mr. Foley said state and federal revenues were essentially flat, which has been a typical situation over the last few years.

Mr. Foley said he would take some of the budget goals and review those in order to inform the Board on how the budget has changed, what the County is paying for, and the initiatives included in the budget. He stated that, in terms of meeting mandates and obligations, the first priority is to provide support to the local School Division, so this budget provides a \$4 million or 3.6% increase to the school system in terms of local funds to support education. Mr. Foley said the proposal reduced the funding gap originally presented by the Superintendent about a month ago – from \$3.2 million down to about \$1.25 million. He said the School Division is hoping for some additional state dollars which would reduce that gap even further. He stated that the budget fully funds some commitments which were made in previous fiscal years; fully funds water resource protection mandates from the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) and the Virginia Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ); provides funding for a transportation planner and two Commonwealth's Attorney Office positions approved as amendments in the current year; provides funding for the opening of the Northside Library, which was due to open in the next month or so; and supports for the next seven months the Regional Firearms Training Facility, which was an essential facility regionally for public safety staff. Mr. Foley said this budget provides a fairly significant increase to the jail, explaining that the County is a member of a regional jail system along with the City of Charlottesville and Nelson County, and those expenses having increased as much as 19% or \$600,000. He stated that the County has been spending a lot of time figuring out its long-term solid waste solutions for the future and how it would manage this challenge. He said this budget includes funding for that.

Mr. Foley said, in terms of the second goal of sustaining an efficient and adaptable organization, the budget includes training, funding, continued funding for innovation and grants leveraging to try to get a return on investment and save money in the long run, funds essential operations for County departments, and begins to address some compensation issues, particularly compression. He explained that salary compression has occurred as a result of salaries for existing staff not increasing much and the hiring of new employees who have come in at about the same level as staff who have been with the County for a number of years. He stated that the County would expand access to Board meetings to citizens by establishing video streaming technology, and the budget also proposes the creation of a joint local government and schools innovation and efficiency review committee to look further into consolidations and efficiencies between School Division and Local Government. Mr. Foley said, to address the third goal of building critical capacity for the organization, the budget targets a 2.3% salary increase or higher based on performance, and that would not begin in July but would be delayed until January. He stated that this budget includes five additional police officers, one crime analyst, two social services workers, some administrative support for fiscal and legislative operations, and restoration of some of that capacity by adding a few positions: a policy analyst, zoning enforcement position, a mechanic, a stormwater inspector, and one information technology position. Mr. Foley stated that the proposed budget also funded items related to transportation needs which have changed considerably for the community, provides funding for the Places 29 small area plan around the Rio interchange and also provides funding for the Route 29 Solutions business assistance program for those businesses around the Route 29/Rio Road intersection that would be impacted during the construction period.

Mr. Foley stated that the next two goals are the most significant changes made to this budget, and are items which are driving the different look as mentioned earlier. He said, with the first goal of redirecting current funding from enhancements to core services, the budget redirects funding from expansions and enhancement capital projects to critical core operating needs of the School Division and Local Government. Mr. Foley said the County currently has a transfer of approximately \$20.2 million of ongoing revenues to the capital program, and this budget would redirect \$1.6 million of that total from capital to operations to pay for critical service needs, with that amount representing the value of one penny on the tax rate. He stated that this would help pay for enrollment growth challenges, police staffing, human service needs compensation, and some of the mandates and obligations. Mr. Foley said this change would not be without impact to the capital program and primarily, by redirecting and reducing some programs as well as liquidating some projects, the County would be able to move the \$1.6 million to the operating side. He stated that, principally, the programs impacted would be ACE, the school modernization project and the construction of sidewalks. He added that, by not funding those programs

going forward, the County would generate the \$1.6 million to help pay for police officers and school enrollment growth. Mr. Foley emphasized that the County is not abandoning its commitment to the capital program, but stated that the most important needs to keep going include continued focus on maintenance and replacement needs for schools and general government and also protecting core facilities. He stated that the proposed budget continues the courts project, which had been worked on for the last several years, provides upgrades and improvements to the 911 regional system, provides for the Hollymead dam repair, school safety improvements, the Western Albemarle High School environment studies academy phase one, and construction of the Pantops Fire Station, as well as some renovations to the Berkmar Rescue Station.

Mr. Foley said the other major proposal in this budget to help it balance is the dedication of any proposed tax increase to specific core services. He said this budget establishes a separate fire rescue services fund to provide complete transparency about one of the largest growing expenditures in the budget; it combines all revenues and expenditures into one fund that can be easily evaluated by the public; and provides the capability for the County to track that in this year as well as any increases in future years. He stated that the budget proposes a one-cent dedicated tax increase and proposes to allocate 6.6 cents of the current rate to fund this critical service which would raise that amount to 7.6 cents totally dedicated to this new fund. Mr. Foley said this budget would pay for growing capital expenses, increase support for volunteers, and replace \$743,000 in lost federal grants to pay for nine firefighter EMTs who are currently providing services on the busiest corridor in the County – Route 29. Without the replacement of that funding, he said there would be a pretty dramatic decrease in service levels for emergency services. Mr. Foley said the total fund would be \$14.5 million, with \$13.8 million of that going to operating and about \$650,000 worth of capital expense in that new fund.

Mr. Foley stated that the reason for this approach was the fact that fire rescue services have expanded significantly over the past 10-15 years due to growing demand for critical emergency response services. Mr. Foley presented a map that highlighted the development areas around the City of Charlottesville, and where the County has tried to focus its growth. He noted the representation of the County in 1999, stating that there was no immediate coverage in the development areas where the population was the densest. He said the one exception to that was the Seminole Trail Volunteer Fire and explained that, in 1999, Seminole station had five career staff helping with daytime coverage, but the other development areas were completely uncovered for immediate response within the development areas. Mr. Foley stated that, in looking at the map now, the Board could see the current system which was built to try to improve the critical service area of fire and EMS protection. He said, to the south of the City, the map notes the Monticello Fire Rescue Station, the Hollymead Fire Rescue Station is to the far north, and the recently opened Ivy Fire Rescue Station is to the west. Mr. Foley said this is what the County has put in place over the past 10-15 years, which has led staff to the idea of separating this fund out for the public to consider. He stated that the one underserved area noted on the map is Pantops, east of the City, and this budget begins the process of designing and constructing that station to fill the last hole in the development areas.

Mr. Foley said this is an essential service, and is critically important for the public. He noted that, over time, the County has dramatically increased its support for the volunteer system in a combination career/volunteer system, improved funding for marketing and recruitment of new volunteers, increased the training budget, provided operational funding for volunteer stations so they did not have to do as much fundraising and could focus more on necessary training, and added daytime career staffing to Berkmar, Scottsville and East Rivanna rescue stations. Mr. Foley said the overall system has been enhanced by replacing aging apparatus and enhancing the emergency fleet overall for both volunteers and career staff, and has enhanced career staffing at Earlysville, Stony Point and Seminole Trail volunteer fire departments. He stated that, in addition to the three new fire stations construction, the County has dramatically increased its attention to EMS services, which had resulted in daytime service at Earlysville, Pantops and Ivy, and 24/7 coverage at Monticello, Hollymead, and Seminole Trail. He said, even with the increased expenditures and focus, when compared to similar localities – Stafford, Spotsylvania or Hanover, for example – Albemarle still operates at one of the lowest cost per capital fire departments in the state. Mr. Foley said the County has worked efficiently to achieve dramatic improvements in service but, obviously, this is a very fast-growing part of the County's budget.

Mr. Foley stated that the final goal is structured community dialogue as it looks to the future because this budget does not solve all of the County's challenges. He said this budget includes the creation of a citizen committee to focus on long-term funding alternatives for unmet needs in the capital program, to address those compelling operational needs such as police officers and any aspirations the County might have as a community going forward, all of which would provide the quality of life that is so greatly valued. Mr. Foley said the group would consider such things as service districts, bond referendums where voters would have to decide on various capital projects, alternative sources of new revenue, and any other solutions the citizen group might think were important.

Mr. Foley said, in thinking about the overall budget, it would be important to take a step back and think about the one-cent increase and its reallocation even with the challenges being faced. He presented a chart showing how tax bills are impacted. Mr. Foley presented a graph showing that, with the one-cent tax increase, tax bills exceeded what those were in 2009 for the first time. He said this reflects both tax increases and increases in values and, with the proposed budget, the average tax payer would pay \$23 more per year than they did in 2009. He stated that, in addition, the difference between 2014 and 2015 represents a \$100 increase in the average tax bill for the average homeowner. Mr. Foley stated that, in terms of County staffing, which usually drives the majority of expenditures and, even with the proposed budget, the County has remained below FY 2007 levels on a per-capita basis. He said staff has tried to build back in a very efficient way, and has yet to exceed those expenses on a per-capita basis

for staffing. Mr. Foley said, in terms of the top 20 most populated counties in Virginia, Albemarle's tax rate is at the bottom, particularly those localities facing the same types of challenges of urbanization and growth that Albemarle County is faced with.

Mr. Foley stated that this budget begins to address the most pressing issues and is based on new approaches and some challenging choices. He said staff recognizes that there are many popular programs and initiatives that were not funded, and some that have been reduced as a result. He said the budget does maintain a focus on efficiency and innovation as was done through the recession years, with one example being the joint local government and schools internal review committee, which would continue to look for efficiencies and consolidations between both organizations. Mr. Foley stated that the budget proposes that a citizen committee sit down with leadership and staff to help solve some of these challenges going forward. He referenced the gap in the budget he mentioned at the beginning of his presentation, and said that would be a challenge the County would ask the citizen group to help address going forward. He noted that, while the process would begin with this proposed plan, it would also need to continue. He said this presentation is the beginning of the process, but there would be other opportunities for the public to observe the Board's deliberations and also provide comments. Mr. Foley said, between February 23 and March 11, there would be four budget work sessions by the Board to consider this proposal and make changes it felt were appropriate. On April 1, he said there would be a public hearing on the Board's proposed budget after Supervisors made amendments to the budget that he had presented. He noted that the tax rate itself would have a separate public hearing on April 8. Mr. Foley emphasized that each of those meetings provide an opportunity for the public to listen to the Board's deliberations or participate in public hearings. He stated that his presentation was online, and there were other online opportunities for citizens to provide comments on the proposed budget.

Ms. Dittmar stated that she had received several emails from constituents asking when certain topics would be addressed. She announced that the Board's work session on February 24 would be an overview on the CIP and debt, which would include a discussion of the ACE program. She said, on February 26, the Board would be looking at Schools and General Government, including Judicial and, on March 3, the Board would cover the remainder of General Government departments and would also include a discussion on the advertised tax rate. She stated that the last work session is scheduled for March 11, and that would cover the finalized proposed budget.

Mr. Foley noted that all of that information is available online.

Ms. McKeel asked if all of the police officer positions were on-duty officers, because she thought one might be an analyst.

Mr. Foley clarified that there were six total police officers in the proposed budget, five being patrol officers and one being a crime analyst.

Ms. Dittmar stated that the next part of the meeting would be public comment, and she asked Ms. Mallek and Ms. Palmer to review the ground rules and protocol for speakers.

Mr. Rex Linville addressed the Board, stating that he is a resident of the Samuel Miller District and a staff member of the Piedmont Environmental Council (PEC). Mr. Linville said he wanted to speak on two inter-related aspects of the Comprehensive Plan as those relate to the budget before the Board, both of which are expressed in the Comp Plan quite clearly. He stated that one was protection of the rural area as a place where agriculture and forestry would dominate, and another was investment in the growth area as a place where people can live, work and play. Mr. Linville said, without simultaneously working on these two things, the County runs the risk of having the growth and development that should be taking place in the growth area spilling into the rural area and really sets a bad example of both. He stated that, as it relates to the protection of the rural area, he wanted to touch on the removal of the ACE program from the future of the County. Mr. Linville said ACE has been one of the more successful land preservation programs in the Commonwealth, and Albemarle was one of the most successful counties in terms of land protection, with almost 93,000 acres protected due to the generosity of landowners in the County and also the investment the Board has made in the protection of the rural area. He stated that about 10% of those acres are protected through the Acquisition of Conservation Easements (ACE) program, and are properties that would not have been protected without the program. Mr. Linville said, as it relates to the urban area, if the County is not making investments for things like a pedestrian overpass, as the speaker mentioned earlier, or sidewalks, or bike paths, or indoor recreation facilities, then the County will not have a vibrant place for people to live and work in the urban area.

Ms. Charlotte Hogue addressed the Board stating that she is a resident of the Samuel Miller District. Ms. Hogue asked the Board when it proposed to cut back on spending and stop raising taxes. She asked if the Board checked to see if funds requested were really needed, or if it just rubber stamped anything that came along. She said the School Division is never satisfied, and its demands are larger each year. Ms. Hogue urged the Board not to give into threats by teachers that they would leave if they did not get more money. She added that the costs for extracurricular activities such as sports, arts, and music lessons should be paid for entirely by the parents. She asked if the Board reviewed all of the County departments to see if any of those should be cut back or eliminated. She said the Board should seriously consider the size and design of new buildings and make them functional, without lavish and/or unnecessary details. Ms. Hogue asked if streetscapes were really a wise choice for spending tax dollars, and urged Supervisors to think long and hard before saying yes to requests. She stated that the Board was elected to represent all citizens of the County, not just selected groups. She stated that many homeowners cannot afford the increases in their taxes caused by the new assessment, and now a tax rate increase was being proposed. Ms. Hogue emphasized that people need to show responsibility for

themselves and not expect others to pay for their desires and wants. She stated that this money was not the Board's to use or spend; it was earned by and belonged to the taxpayer. She urged the Board not to approve any tax rate increase – not one cent more.

Mr. Robert Hogue of the Samuel Miller District addressed the Board, stating that it is another year with the same old thing – the school system has a budget shortfall. He asked the Board to think about the cost of the fancy school gym in Crozet, and asked why school busses are still running on dead-end private roads. Mr. Hogue said school sports should be 100% funded by the parents, and the past corruption in the sports department at Monticello High was another reason to take the tax dollars out of school sports. He said, in the future, the Board should be looking at online schools instead of brick and mortar school buildings, and asked the Board not to cover the school system's budget shortfall. Mr. Hogue stated that, last fall when he came to the County building to pay his taxes, it was a very windy day with 25 mph wind gusts, and two employees were blowing leaves. He said the minute they went around the corner, gusts of wind blew the leaves back in the area they had cleaned. He said this was tax dollars wasted and, as large as the County government is, a little bit of waste here and there adds up to millions of dollars. Mr. Hogue said he was not against the search for Hannah Graham, but the way they searched was wasteful with too much of it being a photo opportunity and inefficient methods of searching. He stated that whether people were for or against the bypass, there were millions of dollars wasted with nothing to show for their tax dollars. Mr. Hogue said the cost for county parks and all recreational facilities should be covered by user fees. He stated that, regarding the Tax Relief for the Elderly Program, after someone's death, the County should be reimbursed through the sale of their home. He stated that property assessments went up, which meant more money for the County, but household income was down because wages had not recovered from the recession. He noted that, in 2014, that income was at 1999 levels. Mr. Hogue concluded by stating that he was against the tax increase.

Ms. Ravenn Gethers addressed the Board, stating that she lived in the City and was before the Board to advocate on behalf of the African-American Teaching Fellows (AATF) as their Executive Director and for the FY15-16 budget recommendation process. Ms. Gethers said the AATF's mission is to recruit, support, develop and retain a cadre of African-American teachers to serve the schools of Charlottesville and Albemarle County. She stated that, as a result, its mission is tied to the County's government strategic goal for educational opportunities, and the schools' strategic plan, specifically the objectives related to expansion of partnerships and investing the full community in supporting student achievement and outcomes for success. Ms. Gethers said AATF also addresses the schools' human resources key performance indicators of minority instructional staff. She stated that each of her organization's fellows is committed to teaching in either City or County public schools and, in 2013, three of the 15 minority hires for those schools were developed and supported by her organization, and were retained for the current school year. Ms. Gethers said these teachers worked with almost 200 students, touched the lives of 300 children, and connected with more than 90 families. She stated that the main strategic goal for the Albemarle County Public Schools (ACPS) states that all students would graduate having mastered the lifelong learning skills they need to succeed as 21st Century learners, workers and citizens. Ms. Gethers said their fellows impact all students and Matt Hass, ACPS Assistant Superintendent and AATF Board member, has said, "Through hard work, dedication and the support of AATF and each other, these new teachers become role models, encouraging all students, regardless of race and ethnicity, to celebrate differences, understand similarities, and develop self-awareness." She requested the Board of Supervisors reconsider funding AATF for the FY15-16 recommended budget.

Mr. Tom Olivier of the Samuel Miller District addressed the Board, stating that he was speaking on behalf of Advocates for a Sustainable Albemarle Population (ASAP) and thanked Mr. Foley and staff for the extensive and excellent work they had done to pull the budget together. Mr. Olivier said, a year ago, unfunded state mandates and growth-driven needs for new public safety positions and new public education expenditures dominated the budget discussions and, tonight, those same demands dominated the discussion. He stated that some of the state mandates are to fix water quality problems caused by earlier growth and it was clear that, for the past two years, population growth has driven much of the County's budget woes. Mr. Olivier said, if population continues to increase as projected, future budget development processes would continue to provide this déjà vu again and again. He stated that it was time to do something different and, to break the cycle of budget woes, ASAP proposes that the root problem be addressed. Mr. Olivier said ASAP continues to propose the County adopt planning and other policies aimed at stabilization of its population at a publicly determined right size. He said, without growth, there would not be the annual need to add police and expand the schools, and there might not be an annual need to contemplate tax increases. He stated that ASAP felt funding the ACE program should be maintained or increased, as conservation easements not only protect natural resources, they limited growth and its physical impacts. Mr. Olivier said, if ASAP was to protect its open spaces, ASAP believes the two rural area planning positions lost during the recession must be restored. He noted that the Community Development Department was still disproportionately reduced from its pre-recession levels. Since long-term planning was done within that department, he said ASAP felt it was dangerous to continue with the heavy level of staff reductions in which it currently operates.

Ms. Lisa Jones addressed the Board, stating that she is the principal at Cale Elementary School, 1757 Avon Street Extended, and thanked the Board for the opportunity to speak. Ms. Jones said, on December 16, 2012, President Obama spoke at a vigil for the Newton shooting victims, and she paraphrased from his speech: "Teaching our children well is something we can only do together with the help of friends and neighbors, the help of a community, and the help of a nation. We realize that we bear responsibility for every child. This is our first task. Caring for our children. It is our first job. If we do not get that right, we do not get anything right. That's how, as a society, we will be judged. We can truly say as a nation that we are meeting our obligations." She stated that she was before the Board to ask whether the community was doing everything it could to invest in their children's future, and whether the

County was meeting obligations and responsibilities to the community to educate their children. Ms. Jones said she supported the School Board's funding request to recruit and compensate quality teachers and maintain small class sizes and also its request to fully fund growth. She stated that, in order to support the School Board's desire to provide high quality public service in a county with growing needs, additional funding is needed to address challenges presented by changing demographics. Ms. Jones said funding the schools with these challenges in mind would include the following: the need for a robust, world language program in the elementary school to prepare all children for a global society and the need for professional development to provide training on how to address the needs of students in poverty who often suffer from cognitive lags due to the lack of rich language and enriching experiences. She stated that this type of instruction benefits all students, not only those at risk. Ms. Jones said the schools also need a comprehensive preschool program to prepare students for school readiness. She noted that providing all students with the highest level of a quality education is an investment in their future, and the future as a thriving community. She stated that there are children who cannot wait another two or three years for the investment to happen; they need it now. Ms. Jones said the Board should consider how kindergarten children will judge it when they look back on graduation on how the County invested in them and whether they will say the community made them its first task, or saw it as its job to ensure their success and prepared them to be productive citizens, or met the obligation or responsibility to them as a community.

Ms. Angela Stokes of the Samuel Miller District addressed the Board, and presented a video about students in poverty.

Ms. Jessie Clark of the Scottsville District addressed the Board, stating that she was before the Board to talk about the world languages program and the wonderful work that the teachers, students and administration are doing at Cale Elementary. Ms. Clark said her son has been learning Spanish for three hours each week since Kindergarten and now, in his third year at Cale, he has been placed in the Spanish immersion program with fantastic results. She stated that his teacher, Ms. Montavo, has said he now understands what she is saying in Spanish and even translates for his classmates. Ms. Clark said, just halfway through the year, he went from understanding just a bit of Spanish to understanding a great deal. She stated that all of the parents she has talked to about the world languages program at Cale are extremely impressed, and say they wish their children had that opportunity at their schools. She stated that she was thankful her child has been given this opportunity, and said that Albemarle has taken an important first step with the world languages program.

Ms. Nancy Carpenter of the Scottsville District addressed the Board, stating that she did not realize until she saw the video that Albemarle County had 810 students now in poverty, which relates directly to what Mr. Foley said about a 44% increase in five years of students needing free and reduced breakfast and lunch. Ms. Carpenter said she did not have any children or grandchildren in public school, but felt it was important that children here receive an exceptional education in Albemarle County. She stated that the community wants them to stay here, take advantage of the Economic Development Office, and become the entrepreneurs in the late 21st Century. Ms. Carpenter said this also illustrates to her how the inefficiencies in Richmond and Washington are affecting Albemarle County and what it can and cannot do for citizens. She stated that there will be a great commercial development coming to 5th Street, and some of the people in that development would be able to walk there, but there would be a great number of people who would not be able to take advantage of those pedestrian opportunities. Ms. Carpenter said there are some City business owners who are trying to advocate for a parking management plan, and part of that plan requires a robust transportation system in order to alleviate cars in the downtown area. She said she is interested to see the County's commitment to public transportation in the budget. She stated that she would hate to see it cut by too much, as a good regional system is needed and a robust transportation plan would also help set the County and the region apart from other areas. Ms. Carpenter said larger companies may also want to locate here and recruit students who are not college graduates, so they can stay here and maintain the great community that Charlottesville is.

Mr. Carter Lindblom addressed the Board, stating that he is a Rivanna District resident and a 5th grader at Stony Point Elementary. Mr. Lindblom said he was before the Board to request that it fully fund Albemarle County Schools for the 2015-16 school year at the level requested by the School Board. Mr. Lindblom said he believes he attends the best elementary school in the County and, on any given day, he has the opportunity to program software, learn geometry, read great books, practice for the school play, build a fort on the playground with sticks and leaves, and learn the anatomy of a cell. He stated that he might participate in the school spelling bee, make a painting of a sea creature, and learn about Virginia's role in the Civil War. Mr. Lindblom said he might visit the library or the music room, or take a walk on the nature trail. He stated that his school encourages students to be "makers," and Mr. Johnson, Ms. Passman, and the other teachers have set up a makers' space where students can freely build with various materials and tools. Mr. Lindblom said they have learned how to program Arduino boards and create models for the 3-D printer, and many students asked for these types of systems, which allows them to create things at home that they could bring to school to share. He stated that, without Stony Point, students would not have known that 5th graders can be computer programmers capable of solving complex problems. Mr. Lindblom said all of his experiences at school have helped him learn: his music and art classes have helped with math, his reading group helps him think critically, gym and recess help him stay healthy, history helps him learn about his world, and science helps him stay curious.

There being no further public comment, the Chair closed the public hearing.

Ms. Palmer asked if the budget cuts for the next five years meant taking ACE out for the next five years. Mr. Foley explained that the proposal was to maintain funding for ACE, sidewalks, and a minimal amount for modernization of schools using one-time money in this coming fiscal year, but not to provide

any ongoing funding until there had been a public discussion and until the Board considers further how it would pay for those things. He stated that, for the ACE program, \$250,000 in one-time money is set aside in balances which would allow the County to match any grant monies that would be available next year. Mr. Foley clarified that \$250,000 would be set aside in the CIP balance and would be separate from current ACE funding. He noted that there was a balance in the current ACE pot to pay for easements which had already been requested via applications that had come in. He stated that staff does have the numbers, which they will share with the Board at its meeting the following day, including how much the balance is and what is being anticipated in terms of the current application pool. Mr. Foley explained that the \$250,000 to which he was referring would be for a future application pool beyond what had currently been identified.

Ms. Palmer asked if that would be just for the first year, and if that meant the Board would have to come up with some other kind of decision for the next five years. Mr. Foley said, beyond the one year of funding, the CIP does not show any more funding for ACE. He stated that it is clear ACE is a popular program but, because items such as police officers are presenting the most pressing challenge, ACE funding would discontinue unless perhaps, through a bond referendum, the voters decide to support ACE on an ongoing basis. Mr. Foley said James City County had a similar program approved in a referendum, which resulted in 10 years of funding set aside because the public thought it was a worthwhile expenditure.

Ms. Palmer asked him to clarify if that was the same with sidewalk funding for the next five years. Mr. Foley said, in essence, the same thing applies for school modernization, sidewalks and ACE. He said there is some one-time money in some balances which staff would propose be used in the first year while this discussion about long-term commitment to the funding of those programs occurs. He stated that there is money to bring down some state dollars which would match it in order to do some sidewalk projects. Mr. Foley said, with school modernization, County staff is working closely with the Superintendent's Office about what minimal amounts of things they consider to be the most critical in terms of modernizing schools but it would be a minimal amount just to do what the School Division considers essential in terms of upgrades. He said, for example, if a lighting upgrade was considered to be the most impactful thing that could be done for a classroom, they would want to put a little bit of money in to continue that for the next year and make some progress while the conversation regarding long-term funding continued.

Ms. Palmer said she had several constituents email her about the growth in poverty, the 810 students mentioned in the video presented, and asked if the criteria to identify the poverty situation changed, and how it might have changed in the last few years. Mr. Foley said staff would follow up with an answer to that specifically.

Ms. McKeel stated that it is going to be important for the Board during its work sessions to be very clear. She stated that she was not sure the public realizes, with the proposed funding request, that a lot of things would be off the table going forward, and the capacity for doing things in the County was drying up. She said there is a sidewalk project currently at Hydraulic Road and Barracks Road which was proposed to happen during this year, and her understanding from staff very recently was that there currently is not enough money to complete that project as it was proposed, so the community is being asked to prioritize within that project. Ms. McKeel said the County is already cutting back an existing program, and she would like to have that discussion during the CIP discussions.

Mr. Foley said the Board would definitely have that discussion, adding that he believed existing projects that were short on funding had enough allocated to get those completed.

Ms. McKeel said that was not what Supervisors were told in the public hearing, so it needs to be clarified. She said this seems to happen a lot with county projects. She stated that the community was told clearly to prioritize 1, 2 and 3 because staff doubted there would be enough money.

Mr. Foley said there are a handful of projects in that state so staff would talk specifically about which ones were funded or not.

Ms. McKeel stated that somehow the Board will have to get the public engaged in this process and that the County will need their help.

Ms. Dittmar said that is part of the proposal, i.e. to look at the things that are key areas which the County either lacks capacity in or aspires to, and take a look at where the County could use some of the other strategies besides tax increases. She stated that perhaps this is part of what the community needs to look at also, and is a project going forward prior to five-year planning in the fall.

Mr. Foley said staff would like to use it so the Board could consider it next year when Supervisors do its five-year look.

Ms. McKeel stated that she was concerned about the message the public is getting from the press regarding a one-cent increase and, going forward, citizens hear that and think that it is business as usual.

Mr. Foley said this would not reflect the presentation and discussion that the Board and staff have had, both in the fall and currently but, as they continue to go forward, staff will continue to work on getting that message out because it is a critical point. He stated that there are tough choices in this budget on some good programs but, at some point, there is a need to acknowledge that the reallocation is the value

of a penny from capital, and there is a penny just to keep up with fire and rescue initiatives to maintain services. Mr. Foley said this is without a lot of other items even being addressed, so there is a need for a conversation about what the County will aspire to in the future, even in terms of basic services.

Ms. Mallek asked if the Berkmar and Pantops improvements currently in the CIP would be paid for out of the extra penny and if what was assigned to those improvements in the CIP would be transferred to other projects. Mr. Foley explained that those funds would go back to pay for police officers, social services workers, etc. He stated that, with the penny raised that goes into the fire fund, the portion needed to support capital was going over to the capital fund to support it, which has freed up the dollars to address the police, social services, and enrollment growth. He noted that it was a bit complicated, but the technicalities of this would be discussed during the CIP work session.

Ms. Mallek said the idea that the County was proposing to turn its backs on the state match for sidewalks and roads was a serious problem for her. Mr. Foley noted that would not be the case in year one.

Ms. Mallek said the proposal is to not put the million dollars in, therefore, the County would not be getting the million dollar match. Mr. Foley said, in the out years, the County would not put anything in currently. He stated that the County would be leaving money on the table from the state, because there was just not enough money if the County was going to pay for police officers, enrollment growth and so forth. He said last year's adopted CIP relied on further tax increases to match those dollars, so it was a dilemma the County has had for a while. He noted that those funds were built into the CIP based on future tax increases so it was a dilemma the County had to deal with one way or another. Mr. Foley noted that the County has a five-year plan, but it is funded one year at a time. He agreed with Ms. Mallek that it was a challenge to leave that money on the table.

Ms. Dittmar asked at what meeting Board members would delve further into the proposed fire and EMS plan. Mr. Foley said that discussion would take place at the Board's March 3 meeting, at which time Supervisors would discuss the General Fund. He noted that the order would be: CIP, School Division and then General Fund.

Agenda Item. No. 8. From the Board: Committee Reports and Matters Not Listed on the Agenda.

Ms. Mallek said, in October, she had followed up again on the truck ban procedures started over a year earlier for Earlysville Road, and was told it was in the pipeline, however, the public hearing for it never happened. She asked if the work could move forward to that next step, as there were a lot of people who had put in a lot of time.

Mr. Foley said staff would provide a written status report on that.

Ms. Mallek reported that the Board received, by e-mail, an annual report from the ACE Committee. She stated that one of the reasons ACE was able to get an additional \$130,000 from the state farmland preservation money was because the County had the match. Ms. Mallek noted that, if all of the properties being appraised decided to sell their easements to the County, the County would still be short \$1/2 million. She noted that the program was zeroed out four or five years ago because of the recession and it has taken this long to build it back again.

Ms. Palmer asked how much of the \$3 million in grant funding for 2014 was matching funds. Mr. Foley said, when the Board received its Board packet the following Wednesday, Supervisors would see a complete breakdown of everything funded with those grants. He said, with ACE, for example, there was just under \$200,000 in 2014 for that program, adding that the County recently received \$286,000, which had to be matched dollar for dollar.

Ms. Palmer stated that she and Ms. Mallek recently met at Sugar Hollow along with a group from the park service and the City. She said they had some subsequent meetings with police and another one planned with Fire/Rescue. She said one of the things that arose was the fact that there had been a party with about 600 University of Virginia students who were bussed to Sugar Hollow for a party at the Blue Hole. She said one of the problems there involves great overuse for certain situations, and she wondered how that discussion might proceed. Ms. Palmer said some of these parties are roving parties, but she would like to discuss these parties which go out into the community in large numbers.

Ms. McKeel said the Planning and Coordination Council (PACC) is planning a discussion on safety at its next meeting, so this might tie into questions which could be asked. She confirmed that the next meeting is scheduled in May.

Agenda Item. No. 9. From the County Executive: Report on Matters Not Listed on the Agenda.

There was none.

Agenda Item. No. 10. Adjourn to February 24, 2015, 5:00 p.m., Room 241.

At 7:32 p.m., Mr. Boyd **moved** to adjourn the Board meeting to February 24, 2015 at 5:00 p.m. in Room 241 of the County Office Building. Ms. Mallek **seconded** the motion. Roll was called and the motion passed by the following recorded vote:

AYES: Ms. Dittmar, Ms. Mallek, Ms. McKeel, Ms. Palmer, Mr. Sheffield and Mr. Boyd.
NAYS: None.

Chairman

Approved by Board
Date: 10/07/2015
Initials: EWJ